

Parliamentary Assembly
Assemblée parlementaire



EN06PV 6

AS (2006) PV 6
Edition provisoire

2006 ORDINARY SESSION

(First part)

SIXTH SITTING

Thursday 26 January 2006 at 10 a.m.

MINUTES OF PROCEEDINGS

Mr René van der Linden, President of the Assembly, took the Chair at 10.10 a.m.

1. ATTENDANCE REGISTER

The names of the Representatives, Substitutes and Observers who signed the attendance register are given in the Appendix.

2. MINUTES

The minutes of the fourth sitting were agreed to.

3. CHANGES IN THE MEMBERSHIP OF COMMITTEES

The Assembly ratified the changes in the membership of committees as set out in document Commissions (2006)1 Addendum 3.

4. ORGANISATION OF DEBATES

On the proposal of the President, the Assembly agreed to interrupt the list of Speakers in the urgent procedure date at around 11.25 a.m.

5. DEBATE UNDER URGENT PROCEDURE: SITUATION IN BELARUS ON THE EVE OF THE PRESIDENTIAL ELECTION

Speaker (on a point of order): Mr Vladimir Zhirinovskiy.

The Report of the Committee on Political Affairs (Doc. 10806 rev) was presented by Mr Andres Herkel, Rapporteur.

The oral opinion of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights was presented by Mr Christos Pourgourides, Rapporteur.

The opinion of the Committee on Culture, Science and Education (Doc. 10814) was presented by Mr Andrew McIntosh, Rapporteur.

The debate was opened.

Speakers: Mr Vladimir Konoplev, Speaker of the House of Representatives of the Belarus Parliament, Mr Alaksandr Milinkievič, Single Candidate of the Unified Democratic Forces in Belarus, Ms Kateřina Konečná.

Mr Jean-Charles Gardetto, a Vice-President of the Assembly, took the chair in place of Mr René van der Linden

Speakers: Mr Bart van Winsen, Mr Giorgi Bokeria.

Speaker (on a point of order): Mr Vladimir Zhirinovskiy.

Speakers: Mr Emanuelis Zingeris, Mr Adrian Severin, Mr Claudio Azzolini, Mrs Biruté Vėsaitė.

Mr René van der Linden, President of the Assembly, took the chair in place of Mr Jean-Charles Gardetto.

Speakers: Mr Michael Hancock, Mr Victor Kolesnikov, Mr Guennady Ziuganov.

The list of speakers was interrupted.

The text of the remaining speeches could be printed with the official report.

The debate was closed.

Mr Andres Herkel, Rapporteur of the Political Affairs Committee, Mr Christos Pourgourides, Rapporteur of the Committee on Legal Affairs and Human Rights, Mr Andrew McIntosh, Rapporteur of the Committee on Culture, Science and Education, and Mr Konstantin Kosachev, Vice-chairperson of the Political Affairs Committee, replied to the debate.

The Assembly considered the draft resolution contained in Doc. 10806.

The President announced that the amendments to the draft Resolution would be taken in the following order: Nos. 3, 4, 1, 5, 6, 2 and 7.

An amendment (No. 3) was proposed by Mr Andrew McIntosh, on behalf of the Committee on Culture, Science and Education, in the draft resolution, replace paragraph 4 with the following paragraph:

"The Assembly recalls that, four years ago, the Minister of Information promised to send the draft media law to the Council of Europe for advice. In the absence of any action and the media situation deteriorating, the Assembly was forced to adopt its Resolution 1372 (2004) on the persecution of the press in the Republic of Belarus. Two years later, on the eve of the presidential elections, the situation has not improved but actually worsened and freedom of expression is now blatantly flouted. Under such circumstances, the people of Belarus cannot receive the information necessary in order to form freely political opinions and make a democratic choice in the coming elections."

Speakers: Mr Andrew McIntosh, Mr Vladimir Zhirinovskiy, Mr Konstantin Kosachev.

The amendment was agreed to.

Another amendment (No 4) was proposed by Mr Andrew McIntosh, on behalf of the Committee on Culture, Science and Education, in the draft resolution, at the end of paragraph 12.2, add the following words: ", in particular allow all political parties fair and equal access to the electronic and print media".

Speaker: Mr Andrew McIntosh.

An oral sub-amendment to the amendment was proposed by Mr Andres Herkel on behalf of the Political Affairs Committee, in amendment no. 4, to leave out the proposed new words and insert ", in particular ensure equal accessibility to the media during the election campaign for all candidates participating in the presidential election."

The President declared that the oral sub-amendment met the criteria of Rule 34.6.

Speakers: Mr Andres Herkel, Mr Andrew McIntosh, Mr Konstantin Kosachev.

The oral sub-amendment was agreed to.

The amendment, as amended, was agreed to.

The President announced that as a result of amendment No. 4, as amended, being agreed to, tabled amendment No. 1 would fall.

Another amendment (No. 5) was proposed by Mr Andrew McIntosh, on behalf of the Committee on Culture, Science and Education, in the draft resolution, after paragraph 12.9, to insert the following sub-paragraphs:

"comply with Article 19 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and the United Nations' International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights and respect freedom of expression in the media in accordance with Assembly Resolution 1372 (2004) and this present Resolution;

respect academic freedom and in particular provide appropriate conditions for the European Humanities University to return to Minsk and for Belarusian students to participate in studies as well as student organisations abroad."

Speakers: Mr Andrew McIntosh, Mr Konstantin Kosachev.

The amendment was agreed to.

Another amendment (No. 6) was proposed by Mr Andrew McIntosh, on behalf of the Committee on Culture, Science and Education, in the draft resolution, replace paragraph 14 with the following paragraph:

"The Assembly also calls on Council of Europe member states to:

give immediate financial and if necessary logistical support to independent broadcasting to Belarus from abroad, which should preferably employ independent Belarusian journalists and broadcast in the Belarusian language about Belarus;

set up student exchange programmes for students from Belarus and with universities in Belarus;

support humanitarian programmes for young people and children in Belarus."

Speaker: Mr Andrew McIntosh.

An oral sub-amendment to amendment No. 6 was proposed by Mr Andres Herkel, on behalf of the Political Affairs Committee, to leave out the last two sub-paragraphs.

The President declared that the oral sub-amendment met the criteria of Rule 34.6.

Speakers: Mr Andres Herkel, Mr Andrew McIntosh, Mr Konstantin Kosachev.

The sub-amendment was agreed to.

Speakers: Mr Vladimir Zhirinovskiy, Mr Konstantin Kosachev.

The amendment, as amended, was agreed to.

Another amendment (No 2) was proposed by Mr Emanuelis Zingeris, Mr Andrew McIntosh, Mr Josef Jařab, Mr Robert Walter, Mr Paschal Mooney, Mr Zbigniew Rau, Mr Piotr Wach, Mrs Miroslava Němcová, Mr Philippe Nachbar, Mr Ferdinand Devínsky, Mr Christophe Spiliotis-Saquet, in the draft resolution, at the end of paragraph 15.1, add the following words:

"and official media people hired by the Lukashenko regime in order to propagate hatred and intolerance against human rights and democracy".

Speakers: Mr Emanuelis Zingeris, Mr Vladimir Zhirinovskiy, Mr Konstantin Kosachev.

The amendment was not agreed to.

Another amendment (No. 7) was proposed by Mr Andrew McIntosh, on behalf of the Committee on Culture, Science and Education, in the draft resolution, after paragraph 15.3, to insert the following sub-paragraphs:

"support student exchanges from Belarus with universities in the European Union and continue supporting the European Humanities University in exile in Vilnius;

activate immediately financial support which had been allocated to European media broadcasting into Belarus."

Speakers: Mr Andrew McIntosh, Mr Vladimir Zhirinovskiy, Mr Konstantin Kosachev.

The amendment was agreed to.

The Assembly agreed to the draft resolution contained in Doc. 10806, as amended (*Resolution 1482 (2006)*).

The Assembly considered the draft recommendation contained in Doc. 10806.

An amendment (No. 8) was proposed by Mr Andrew McIntosh, on behalf of the Committee on Culture, Science and Education, in the draft recommendation, after paragraph 1.4, add the following sub-paragraphs:

"facilitate entry by young people from Belarus into the territory of member states, for instance in accordance with the European Agreement on Travel by Young Persons on Collective Passports between the Member Countries of the Council of Europe;

instruct its inter-governmental committees in which Belarus participates on the basis of the European Cultural Convention to maintain their contacts with government officials from Belarus at a working level;

establish and extend, at the levels of its Rapporteur Groups and steering committees, contacts with representatives of all democratic political parties, non-governmental organisations and youth organisations from Belarus."

Speakers: Mr Andrew McIntosh, Mr Vladimir Zhirinovskiy, Mr Konstantin Kosachev.

The amendment was agreed to.

The Assembly agreed to the draft recommendation contained in Doc. 10806, as amended (*Recommendation 1734 (2006)*).

6. COMMUNICATION FROM THE COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS TO THE PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY PRESENTED BY MR MIHAI-RĂZVAN UNGUREANU, MINISTER FOR FOREIGN AFFAIRS OF ROMANIA AND CHAIRPERSON OF THE COMMITTEE OF MINISTERS

The President welcomed Mr Mihai-Răzvan Ungureanu, Minister for Foreign Affairs of Romania and Chairperson of the Committee of Ministers.

Mr Ungureanu addressed the Assembly and presented the communication on the activities of the Committee of Ministers (CM/AS (2006) 1).

Mr Ungureanu replied to questions contained in Doc. 10797 put to him by Mr Philippe Nachbar, Mr Jaime Bartumeu Cassany, Mr Christos Pourgourides, Mr Mevlüt Çavuşoğlu, Mr Mehmet Tekelioğlu, Mr Luc Van den Brande and Mr Lluís Maria de Puig.

7. DATE, TIME AND ORDERS OF THE DAY OF THE NEXT SITTING

The next sitting was fixed for Thursday 26 January at 3 p.m. with the following orders of the day:

**1. Policy of return for failed asylum seekers in the Netherlands
Statement from Mrs Rita Verdonk, Minister for Integration and Immigration of the
Netherlands**

- Debate and vote on a draft resolution.

2. The concept of "nation"

- Debate and vote on a draft recommendation, with an amendment.

The sitting was closed at 12.50 p.m.

APPENDIX

Representatives or Substitutes who signed the Attendance Register in accordance with Rule 11.2 of the Rules of Procedure. The names of Substitutes who replaced absent Representatives are printed in small letters. The names of those who were absent or apologised for absence are followed by an asterisk.

AÇIKGÖZ, Ruhi
 ADAM, Ulrich*
 AGRAMUNT, Pedro
 AHLQVIST, Birgitta/Hågg, Carina
 ALITI, Rafis*
 ANDRÉ, René*
 ANTTILA, Sirkka-Liisa
 ARIAS, Miguel*
 ÁRMANNSSON, Birgir
 ARNAUT, José Luis*
 ARRIGO, Robert*
 ARZILLI, Giuseppe*
 ATEŞ, Abdülkadir
 AYDIN, Hüseyin-Kenan*
 AZZOLINI, Claudio
 BADRÉ, Denis*
 BANAC, Ivo/Dorić, Miljenko
 BARGHOLTZ, Helena/Lindblad, Göran
 BARNETT, Doris
 BARTUMEU CASSANY, Jaume
 BATET, Meritxell
 BECERRIL, Soledad
 BEMELMANS-VIDEC, Marie-Louise/van Thijn,
 Ed
 BENDER, Ryszard
 BENEŠ, Miroslav
 BERCEANU, Radu-Mircea*
 BERDZENISHVILI, Levan*
 BÉRZINŠ, Andris
 BIANCO, Gerardo*
 BIBERAJ, Alexandër
 BİLGEHAN, Gülsün
 BJØRNSTAD, Vidar/Asphjell, Jorodd
 BOCCHINO, Italo*
 BOKERIA, Giorgi
 BONDARENKO, Olena
 Van den BRANDE, Luc
 BRAUN, Márton*
 BREEN, Patrick*
 BRESTENSKÁ, Beáta*
 BROSBØL, Kirsten*
 BURLISON, Lord*
 ÇAVUŞOĞLU, Mevlüt
 CEBECİ, Erol Aslan
 CHIKHRADZE, Pikria*
 CHOPE, Christopher
 CHRISTMAS-MØLLER, Pia*
 CHRISTODOULIDES, Doros*
 CILEVIČS, Boriss*
 CIRCENE, Ingrida
 CLIVETI, Minodora
 COLLAVINI, Manlio*
 COLOMBIER, Georges*
 CONTESTABILE, Domenico
 CORTAJARENA, Elvira
 COSARCIUC, Valeriu
 COŞKUNOĞLU, Osman*
 CSÁKY, András*
 CUBREACOV, Vlad
 CZINEGE, Imre/Szalay, Gábor
 DAVERN, Noel*
 DEBONO GRECH, Joseph*
 DEES, Dirk
 DEITTERT, Hubert*
 DEMIRCHYAN, Stepan/Geghamyan, Artashes
 DEVÍNSKY, Ferdinand*
 DIACOV, Dumitru
 DONABAUER, Karl/Ager, Hans
 DROMBERG, Kaarina
 DURRIEU, Josette*
 DZHABRAILOV, Umar/Oskina, Vera
 ELO, Mikko
 EÖRSI, Mátyás
 ERR, Lydie
 ETHERINGTON, Bill
 EVIN, Claude/Loncle, François
 EXNER, Václav
 EYMER, Anke*
 FARKAS, Ivá*
 FARRÉ SANTURÉ, Joan Albert
 FEDOROV, Valery*
 FENECHIU, Relu/Miutescu, Gheorghe Adrian
 FERNÁNDEZ SORIANO, María Emelina*
 FILIPIOVÁ, Daniela/Němcová, Miroslava
 FLYNN, Paul*
 FOSS, Per-Kristian
 FRIDLEIFSDÓTTIR, Siv/Jónsson, Birkir Jón
 FRIMANNSDÓTTIR, Margrét
 FRUNDA, György
 GABURRO, Giuseppe*
 GACEK, Urszula
 GARDETTO, Jean-Charles/Spiliotis-Saquet,
 Christophe
 GASÓLIBA, Carles
 GEDEI, József*
 GILMORE, Eamon*
 GIRZYŃSKI, Zbigniew/Huskowski, Stanislaw
 GJUL, Gunn Karin
 GLĀVAN, Stefan
 GLESENER, Marcel
 GOERENS, Charles*
 GOLDBERG, Pierre/Meyer, Gilbert
 GORIS, Stef
 GRACHEV, Vladimir*
 GREBENNIKOV, Valery
 GRIGNON, Francis*
 GROSS, Andreas*
 GRZYB, Andrzej*
 GÜLÇIÇEK, Ali Rıza
 GUSENBAUER, Alfred/Lindinger, Ewald
 HADŽIAHMETOVIĆ, Azra
 HAGBERG, Michael
 HAIBACH, Holger*
 HAJIYEVA, Gultakin*
 HANCOCK, Michael
 HENRY, Jean-Pol/Pehlivan, Fatma

HERKEL, Andres
 HIMMER, Harald*
 HLADIY, Mykhailo
 HÖFER, Gerd
 HÖGMARK, Anders G.
 HOOPER, Gloria
 HÖRSTER, Joachim
 HURSKAINEN, Sinikka
 HUSEYNOV, Ali*
 HUSEYNOV, Rafael
 IANNUZZI, Raffaele*
 ILAŞCU, Ilie
 ILICALI, Mustafa
 INCEKARA, Halide
 INNOCENTI, Renzo*
 ISLAMI, Kastriot
 IVANOV, Ivan
 IVANOV, Sergei
 IVANOVSKI, Igor*
 IWŃSKI, Tadeusz*
 JACOBSEN, Bjørn*
 JAHIĆ, Elmir/Avdić, Sead
 JAŘAB, Josef/Konečná, Kateřina
 JÁUREGUI, Ramón*
 JAZŁOWIECKA, Danuta*
 JUNG, Armand*
 JURGENS, Erik
 KAIKKONEN, Antti
 KALANOVIĆ, Verica
 KALEZIĆ, Ivan*
 KARAPETYAN, Karen/Naghalyan, Hermine
 KARPOV, Oleksandr*
 KARSKI, Karol*
 KATSELI, Eleonora*
 KIRILOV, Evgeni*
 KLYMPUSH, Orest*
 KNIGHT OF COLLINGTREE, Jill
 KOROBENNIKOV, Anatoliy/Smirnova, Svetlana
 KOSACHEV, Konstantin
 KOSTENKO, Yuriy*
 KOSTYNUK, Bohdan
 KOVALEV, Nikolay*
 KOVALEV, Yuri
 KRSTEVSKI, Zoran*
 KUCHEIDA, Jean-Pierre/Geveaux, Jean-Marie
 KUCLER-DOLINAR, Mojca
 LACHNIT, Petr/Kuřvart, Miloř
 LALOY, Marie-José
 LAMBERT, Geert
 LANDRAIN, Édouard*
 LAVTIŹAR-BEBLER, Darja
 LEGENDRE, Jacques
 LEIBRECHT, Harald*
 LEPPER, Andrzej*
 LEUTHEUSSER-SCHNARRENBERGER,
 Sabine*
 van der LINDEN, René/Platvoet, Leo
 LINTNER, Eduard*
 LLOYD, Tony
 LOBKOWICZ, Jaroslav
 LOUTFI, Younal
 MALINS, Humfrey/Greenway, John
 MANZELLA, Andrea*
 MARGELOV, Mikhail/Pirozhnikova, Liudmila
 MARKOWSKI, Tomasz*
 MARQUET, Bernard/Fautrier, Catherine
 MARTINS, Alberto/Dias Fernandes, Abilio
 MARTY, Dick
 MASI, Tito*
 MASSERET, Jean-Pierre*
 MATUŐIĆ, Frano*
 McCAFFERTY, Chris*
 MEALE, Alan
 MEIMARAKIS, Evagelos
 MELĀAK, Miloř/Āurdová, Anna
 MELNIKOV, Ivan
 de MELO, Maria Manuela
 MENDES BOTA, José
 MERCAN, Murat*
 MESSERSCHMIDT, Morten*
 MIĆUNOVIĆ, Dragoljub*
 MIGNON, Jean-Claude/Cousin, Alain
 MIHKELSON, Marko
 MIKHAILOVA, Nadezhda*
 MIKUTIENĒ, Dangutė/Vareikis, Egidijus
 MILIĆEVIĆ, Ljiljana
 MILO, Paskal*
 MILOJEVIĆ, Goran*
 MIMICA, Neven*
 MOKRY, Vladimir*
 MONFILS, Philippe
 MOTA AMARAL, João Bosco
 MULAS, Giuseppe
 NACHBAR, Philippe
 NAKASHIDZĒ, Nino
 NARO, Giuseppe*
 NAROCHNITSKAYA, Natalia*
 NEGELE, Gebhard
 NĒMETH, Zsolt*
 NIJS, Annette/Veenendaal, Jelleke
 NIKOLIĆ, Tomislav*
 NIKOLOPOULOS, Nikolaos*
 OCCHETTO, Achille
 O'HARA, Edward
 OHLSSON, Carina
 ÖHMAN, Conny
 OLIYNYK, Boris*
 ØSTERGAARD, Morten
 ŐZAL, Ibrahim*
 PADILLA, Julio*
 PANGALOS, Theodoros/Alevras, Athanasios
 PAPADIMITRIOU, Elsa*
 PASHAYEVA, Ganira*
 PERNASKA, Lajla
 POSTOICO, Maria
 POTRATA, Majda/Preseĉnik, Jakob
 POURGOURIDES, Christos
 PREDA, Cezar Florin
 PROVERA, Fiorello*
 PUCHE, Gabino*
 de PUIG, Lluís Maria
 PULLICINO ORLANDO, Jeffrey*
 PUPOVAC, Milorad*
 PYSARENKO, Anatoliy*
 QUESADA, Adoraci3n
 RAGUŹ, Martin
 RAKHANSKY, Anatoliy*
 RAU, Zbigniew

REIMANN, Maximilian/Maissen, Theo
 REYMANN, Marc
 RIESTER, Walter
 RIGONI, Andrea*
 RIVOLTA, Dario*
 ROCHEBLOINE, François
 ROSEIRA, Maria de Belém
 RUPPRECHT, Marlene/Dzembritzki, Detlef
 RUSSELL-JOHNSTON, Russel/Harvey, Nick
 RUSTAMYAN, Armen
 RUŽIĆ, Branko
 RUZZANTE, Piero
 RYBAK, Volodymyr*
 ŠAMI, Zoran
 SCHIEDER, Peter
 SCHMIED, Walter*
 SCHMITT, Ingo/Fischer, Axel
 SCHNEIDER, André
 SCHREINER, Bernard
 SEVERIN, Adrian
 SEVERINSEN, Hanne
 SEYIDOV, Samad*
 SHARANDIN, Yuri*
 ŠILEIKIS, Gintaras
 SLUTSKY, Leonid
 SMITH, Geraldine*
 SOBECKA, Anna/Fetlińska, Janina
 SPINDELEGGGER, Michael
 STĂNOIU, Rodica Mihaela
 STANTCHEVA, Darinka/Atanasova, Aneliya
 STATI, Sergiu/Pasecinic, Arcadii
 STEENBLOCK, Rainer*
 STRÄSSER, Christoph
 SUDARENKOV, Valeriy/Kolesnikov, Victor
 SYMONENKO, Petro*
 SZABÓ, Zoltán*
 TEKELİOĞLU, Mehmet
 TEVDORADZE, Elene
 TIMMERMANS, Frans
 TKÁČ, Vojtech
 TOMLINSON, John
 TOROSYAN, Tigran
 ULRICH, Alexander*
 URBÁNI, Milan*
 VAKSDAL, Øyvind/Woldseth, Karin S.
 VARVITSIOTIS, Miltiadis
 VERA JARDIM, José
 VERMOT-MANGOLD, Ruth-Gaby/Dupraz, John
 VÉSAITÉ, Biruté
 VIS, Rudi
 VOSGANIAN, Varujan*
 VRETTOS, Konstantinos
 WALTER, Robert
 WILLE, Paul
 WILSHIRE, David
 van WINSEN, Bart
 WODARG, Wolfgang
 WOHLWEND, Renate/Frommelt, Doris
 WRIGHT, G.V./Mooney, Paschal
 WURM, Gisela
 YOTOVA, Iliana
 ZACCHERA, Marco*
 ZAPFL-HELBLING, Rosmarie*
 ZAREMBA, Krzysztof/Wach, Piotr

ZAVGAYEV, Akhmar*
 ZHEVAGO, Kostyantyn*
 ZHIRINOVSKY, Vladimir
 ZINGERIS, Emanuelis
 ZIUGANOV, Guennady
 ŽIŽIĆ, Zoran
 de ZULUETA, Tana*
 ŽUŽUL, Miomir*
 Vacant seat AZE*
 Vacant seat CY*

ALSO PRESENT

Representatives and Substitutes not authorised to vote

BOUGAS, Ioannis
 DENDIAS, Nikolaos
 KANELLOPOULOU, Krinio
 SOBKO, Sergey

Special Guests

-

Observers

MILNE, Lorna
 SÁNCHEZ, Sadot

Others

-